

West Elementary School Building Committee Minutes

Thursday, March 19, 2020 – 7:30AM

SC Room – 2nd floor – School Admin Building

Participating via remote

Access Voting Members: Heather Eigen, Janet Nicosia, Siggy Pfenner, Donna Walsh, Jennifer Hunt, Paul Rollins, Elizabeth Roos, Susan McCready

Non-Voting Members: Mark Johnson, Esq., Tracey Spruce, Esq.,

Participating in Person: Paula Colby-Clements, Sheldon Berman, and secretary Alison Phelan

PMA Consultants (remote): Steve Rusteika, Kevin Weeks, Brian DeFilippis

SMMA Architects (remote): Lorraine Finnegan, Matt Rice

West Elementary School Building Committee Chair (SBC), Paula Colby Clements, opened the meeting at 7:33AM. Because of the emergency state of government due to Coronavirus, members are participating via remote access. All votes will be taken by roll call at this meeting.

Approval of Invoices and Change Orders. Minutes approved. Vote expected

On a Motion made by Sheldon Berman and seconded by Janet Nicosia, the West Elementary School Building Committee approved the March 5, 2020 meeting minutes. The motion for the March 5, 2020 meeting minutes was unanimously approved on a 10-0 vote.

The Chair submitted for payment approval- Invoice from PMA Consultants #04303-10 dated March 9, 2020 for the amount of \$18,938.72 for professional services Feb 1-29, 2020.

On a Motion made by Sheldon Berman and seconded by Susan McCready, the West Elementary School Building Committee approved the PMA invoice read by the Chair today. The motion was approved on a roll call vote 10-0.

The Chair submitted for payment approval - Invoice from SMMA Architects #0052448 dated March 5, 2020 for the amount of \$73,480.50 for professional services from Jan 25-Feb 21, 2020.

On a Motion made by Sheldon Berman and seconded by Susan McCready, the West Elementary School Building Committee approved the SMMA invoice read by the Chair today. The motion was approved on a roll call vote 10-0.

Update on PDP Submission to MSBA

Lorraine Finnegan stated PDP is due on March 11th. The MSBA has a limited workforce on site. They will review within 21 days.

Ms. Finnegan reminded the Committee that the next submission to the MSBA is the *PSR – Preferred Schematic Report* which is due on May 6. Both the *PDP – Preferred Design Program* and the *PSR* are part of the feasibility study portion of the project.

Review of Building Concepts and modifications of concepts.

Ms. Finnegan gave the Committee an updated presentation through the [SMMA -West Elem SBC March 18, 2020](#) power point.

Explanation given to committee that they need to vote on a minimum of 3 alternatives for Site Considerations. The addition/renovation option should be one of the alternatives posed although it does not have to be one of the final 3 for consideration.

The Considerations for Construction were listed:

Existing Footprint: drop off/pick up; student play access; phased construction: modular classrooms; wetlands impact; fire access.

Long Term Location – Orientation, fields, parking, building configuration, internal programming and adjacencies, groundwater and ledge elevations.

Ms. Finnegan pointed out that MSBA doesn't define what it will pay/support (i.e. PreK options, café-auditorium) at their review of the PDP. The Committee needs to make a decision regardless and go with it. They may not give us a definitive response until the PSR.

Ms. Finnegan said they plan on filing with Conservation Commission next week but uncertain on whether they are still working because of the state of emergency. Most of the alternatives listed in this document may not have impact on wetlands

Ms. Finnegan pointed out in Slides 5 to 9 grade elevation changes generally from 5 to 12 feet. Slides 5 -9– photos of model – some grade/elevation changes from 5 to 12 feet in general.

Slide 10: (Alternate 3) has changed slightly with increased parking area. The plan is for 205 employees and 280-300 total parking spaces. The PreK part of the building would be built on the south side of the campus. There are 10 modular classrooms as part of Alternate 3.

Slide 11 (Alternate 3A): Access road impact on wetland; Prek is appendage to the building. Fire access gets mostly around the building, but not completely. Orients building a little differently, spreads it out, to the right is the Flexitorium – still 3 story K-5 building; 2-story PreK. There are 10 modular classrooms as part of Alternate 3A.

Slide 12: (Alternate 3B): Similar to Alternate 3B, opens up the front, flexibility to add PreK section later, flips the front part. Entry on Beacon Street and where administrative offices will locate; more volume towards the back of the building. Less impact on wetlands. There are 10-20 modular classrooms as part of Alternate 3B.

All placement of modular classrooms would be done during summer break so no disruption to students. Any demolition would be set during that timeframe as well.

Slide 13 (Alternate 4): No modular classrooms, fire road would impact wetlands, a lot of varying light for classrooms. Both former West Elementary Principal, Liz Roos, and the Superintendent voiced concerns over the management of the building with this layout.

Slide 14: Alternate 5: This has a separate PreK building from the West Elementary proposed building, requires no modular classrooms and has the least impact to the wetlands. The consensus among the Committee that this alternate model would be the most expensive since it would mean doubling the maintenance costs. The Superintendent stated there is some costs savings if we don't have 2 buildings, sharing staff between the buildings would be easier if there was inside access rather than outside. In comparing all alternates, Alternate 3 seems to be the best solution overall, but Alternate 3A and 3B seem feasible as well.

Ms. Finnegan noted Slide 15 displayed the Modular Costs based on recent calculations. She wanted to be sure the Committee took note of the lease vs. buying options as well. It states a 2yr lease would costs approximately \$1.2m vs purchasing modular classrooms for \$1.4m which the District could use for other town projects (i.e. AHS, Doherty) – if the timing was aligned.. The modular classrooms don't have an indefinite lifespan and where to store them when not in usage would also present an issue if the District purchased them vs. leasingthem..

Ms. Finnegan requested from the Committee a vote on the 3 alternates. The Committee believed that they really needed to make their decision on the educational factor. Janet Nicosia echoed the Committee's sentiment to go with the best educational, multigenerational building that will serve the Andover community the best. Committee agreed that the 3 alternates should be on operations and educational factors. Alternate 4 is too long of a building, difficult to manage. Alternate 5 concerns included expense and that it would not make sense to have 2 separate buildings – one for the elementary and one for the PreK.

The other factor with Alternate 3, 3A and 3B is the day lighting being best for general education classrooms – with that portion of the building facing the south; only the flexitorium faces the north side. From a mechanical standpoint, there are no long runs.

On a Motion made by Sheldon Berman and seconded by Susan McCready, the West Elementary School Building Committee voted to eliminate Alternate 4 due to the elongation of the wing which causes significant challenges with respect to the internal management of the building, decreased connectivity of the school community, and the longer runs of mechanical systems. The motion was approved on a 10-0 roll call vote.

On a Motion made by Sheldon Berman and seconded by Susan McCready, the West Elementary School Building Committee voted to eliminate Alternative 5 due to the increased long term costs, both operationally and administratively, that maintaining two separate buildings presents. The motion was approved on a 10-0 roll call vote.

Selection of Next SBC Meeting date(s) and main subject.

Paula reminded the Committee that there are dates set aside to meet every two weeks. Ms. Finnegan will make changes to the slides shown today based on the Committee's comments this morning. Their team will work on the next stage w/the Conservation Commission, and also will review the remaining Alternates that were voted on today.

On a Motion made by Sheldon Berman and seconded by Susan McCready, the West Elementary SBC voted to adjourn the meeting of March 19, 2020 at 9:20am. The Committee voted 10-0 to adjourn.

Respectfully,
Alison Phelan, Recorder